Some Underappreciated Legal Considerations for the Design of Central Bank Digital Currencies

James Grimmelmann Cornell Tech and Cornell Law School

December 17, 2020
University of Hamburg
Law, Finance, and Technology Workshop

In this talk

- CBDCs
- Some familiar legal issues
- Some unfamiliar ones
 - Fraud and mistake
 - Liens
- What to do?

CBDCs

CD CDBC! D CDBC Cs U.

- Currency
- Digital currency
- Central bank digital currency?

Familiar Legal Issues

Blah de blah de blah-de-blah

- Jurisdiction
- A(nti) M(money) L(aundering)
- Tax
- Privacy
- Fin(ancial) Reg(ulation)

Fraud and Mistake

Bad transaction! Bad transaction!

- Disloyal agents
- Impersonation
- Mistake
- Fraud in the factum
- Fraud in the inducement
- ... none of these are detectable on-ledger!

This is not legal advice

- Frauds are voidable
- Forgeries and thefts are void
- Wrongdoers must return what they steal (always)
- Innocent beneficiaries must make restitution (often)

The law wants what it wants

- Legal rules on finality, negotiability, etc.
- Management infrastructure
 - Dispute resolution system?
- Reporting/auditing systems
 - Transaction data + user data + ?
- Cf. Fedwire, credit, debit, Venmo, etc.

Liens

Secured transactions: a 3 credit course in 1 slide

- Borrowers can give *liens* on their property
 - Collection procedures in case of default
 - Priority in case of bankruptcy
- Major source of working capital
 - Especially for small businesses
- Liens can trace into proceeds of transactions

Lenders' questions about digital currency

- Does my lien cover payments made using this currency?
- How can I collect in case of default?
- How can I lock an account so the borrower can't drain it before I can get at it?
- How can I give others notice of my lien?

What to do?

The irrelevant crypto dream

- A digital currency *could* try to thumb its nose at the legal system, and many have
- Can a territorial legal system enforce its laws against an uncooperative digital currency system?
- Good question, but it doesn't matter ...

Emptors don't like to caveat

- Checks and credit cards have extensive protections for the careless and the luckless
 - That's why they're in wide consumer use
- Wire transfers have very few protections
 - They're used almost entirely by businesses—which are exceedingly careful with them
- How big a payment will Joe's Corner Groceries make with a user-beware payment system?

Creditors play Scrooge

- Creditors would be ... unhappy ... to be told that their liens don't reach payments
 - Or that they do, but are practically unenforceable
- Unhappy to the point of forbidding their borrowers from taking payments using the digital currency

Private law is a thing

- Commercial law isn't about enforcing arbitrary rules to enhance state power
- It's about creating a framework that facilitates voluntary transactions
- It solves real problems real people have
- These problems don't just go away
- Solve them, or no one will use your currency

Discussion